5GH Foundation

Coercive Citations on 10.1371/journal.pone.0275472

The anonymous Reviewer 2 for this article [1] provided the authors with three irrelevant references, without offering any specific comments or feedback on the content of the article itself. Notably, the article [1] focuses on biological science, specifically genomic analysis, whereas all three references recommended by the reviewer, with a common author Mehrdad Soleimani Monfared, are related to geographic science, making them largely inapplicable to the research topic.

10.1371/journal.pone.0275472

Coercive Citations

5GH Foundation

The introduction section is a nice one. It is architected very beautifully, while written fully academic and comprehend. I assume that any change in the introduction section is not necessary, but one of the important tasks after publishing a study is to increase its chance to be seen by the most possible number of researchers, so I would like to give two recommendations. First, to get your published study in the list of searched for papers based on keywords, I propose to increase variety of your keywords. In my viewpoint, they do not cover the whole topic of the study and are not widely searched words. I propose to add at least the keyword "data analysis". Second, one of the methods in the publisher's website that brings a publication on to the researchers, is based on the similar publications that they have read before. So, the more you cite similar publication, the more the chance that the search engine in the publisher website propose your paper to the researcher. Besides of that, it will also complete your introduction section. As another advantage, it rises new ideas to the researchers by combining various methods, or resolving drawback of one seen paper by reading the similar one, or extending the methodology to a fully automatic one. So, based on these points, I would like to ask to cite to the following similar publication in the manuscript which used PCA and feature selection for deep learning, but in different field of study. The first proposed publication is: Shahbazi, A., Soleimani Monfared, M., Thiruchelvam, V., Ka Fei, T., Babasafari, A.A., (2020). Integration of knowledge-based seismic inversion and sedimentological investigations for heterogeneous reservoir. Journal of Asian Earth Sciences. The second publication for citation is: Khayer, K., Kahoo, A.R., Soleimani Monfared, M., Tokhmechi, B., and Kavousi, K., (2022). Target-Oriented Fusion of Attributes in Data Level for Salt Dome Geobody Delineation in Seismic Data. Natural resource research, and the other publication could be: Khayer, K., Kahoo, A.R., Soleimani Monfared, M., and Kavouosi, K., (2022). Combination of seismic attributes using graph-based methods to identify the salt dome boundary. Journal of Petroleum Science and Engineering. 215, Part A, 110625.

Despite the unpopularity of projection strategy, it was sometimes evaluated as more effective [7, 8] than the standard feature selection strategy based on statistical tests. Thus, it can be a candidate strategy that can be replaced with feature selection based on statistical tests. In this paper, we try to understand why PCA-based unsupervised FE and TD-based unsupervised FE [3] are effective in feature selection based on projection strategy, since PCA-like as well as TD-like methods were successfully applied in other fields, too [9–11]. We consider the cases biomarker identification of kidney cancer [12] as well as SARS-CoV-2 infection problem [13]; in these studies, despite unsuccessful results obtained by conventional feature selection based on statistical tests, TD-based unsupervised FE identified biologically reasonable genes (for more details about how PCA- and TD-based unsupervised FE are superior to statistical test-based feature selection tools in these specific examples, see these previous studies [12, 13]).

9. Shahbazi A, Monfared MS, Thiruchelvam V, Ka Fei T, Babasafari AA. Integration of knowledge-based seismic inversion and sedimentological investigations for heterogeneous reservoir. Journal of Asian Earth Sciences. 2020;202:104541.
View Article • Google Scholar

10. Khayer K, Kahoo AR, Monfared MS, Tokhmechi B, Kavousi K. Target-Oriented Fusion of Attributes in Data Level for Salt Dome Geobody Delineation in Seismic Data. Natural Resources Research. 2022.
View Article • Google Scholar

11. Khayer K, Roshandel-Kahoo A, Soleimani-Monfared M, Kavoosi K. Combination of seismic attributes using graph-based methods to identify the salt dome boundary. Journal of Petroleum Science and Engineering. 2022;215:110625.
View Article • Google Scholar

[1] 10.1371/journal.pone.0275472
