

## Abnormal Reference Patterns on the Publications by NA Adam

Concerns are raised regarding the reference patterns on several publications coauthored by Nawal Abdalla Adam, who is with Princess Nourah Bint Abdulrahman University, Saudi Arabia.

DOI	Citation to Umair	Authors
10.1002/mde.4509	18/66 (self-citation)	Yunchen Cai (Yancheng Institute of Technology/盐城工学院), <b>Muhammad Umair</b> , Nawal Abdalla Adam, Ruilian Zhang, Sanjar Mirzaiev, Claudia Chang (Wuhan University of Science and Technology/武汉科技大学)
10.1016/j.ecolind.2025.113248	14/23	Zerong Li, Nawal Abdalla Adam, Sanjar Mirzaiev, Shakhzod Saydullaev, Hua Bai (Nanjing Normal University/南京师范大学)
10.1016/j.ecolind.2025.113743	0	---
10.1016/j.ijhydene.2025.03.034	15/51	Jian Chen (Jiangxi University of Technology/江西科技学院), Zhao Yuan (Beihang University/北京航空航天大学), Ping Mei (Jiangxi University of Technology/江西科技学院), Nawal Abdalla Adam, Xiaoyu Chen (Beihang University/北京航空航天大学)
10.1016/j.ijhydene.2025.03.090	20/23 (self-citation)	Rui Qian (Yangzhou University/扬州大学), Norkhairul Hafiz Bajuri, <b>Muhammad Umair</b> , Nawal Abdalla Adam, Zaka Ullah
10.1016/j.anucene.2025.111746	0	---
10.1016/j.ijhydene.2025.05.392	10/49	---
10.1016/j.ecolind.2025.113270	24/36	Bingyan Chen (Henan University of Technology/河南工业大学), Yao Lu (North China University of Water Resources and Electric Power/华北水利水电大学), Muhammad Imran, Nawal Abdalla Adam, Jin Jang (Nanjing Normal University/南京师范大学)
10.1016/j.sfr.2025.100504	0	---
10.1016/j.marpolbul.2025.117922	2/46	---
10.1016/j.jretconser.2020.102136	0	---
10.1016/j.esr.2025.101864	10/24	Yangmei Zhang (Heze University of China/菏泽学院), Nawal Abdalla Adam, Norboy Karimov, Muhammad Khalid, Chen Haoyu (Yanshan University/燕山大学)
10.1016/j.ecolind.2025.113482	7/20	Meixi Chen (Tianjin University/天津大学), Nawal Abdalla Adam, Fatima Gulzar, Xiaokun Li (Northeastern University/东北大学), Munira Azlarova, Basu Roos
10.1016/j.ijhydene.2025.03.066	26/47	Shasha Yu (Southwest Petroleum University/西南石油大学), Sanjar Mirzaiev, Nawal Abdalla Adam, Elchin Eyvazov, Hao Chang (Yanshan University/燕山大学)
10.1016/j.ijhydene.2025.03.140	24/43	Sha Zhiping (Shandong Youth Political College/山东青年政治学院), Nawal Abdalla Adam, Sanjar Mirzaiev, Sabuhi Tanriverdiyev, Ching Bi (Dongbei University of Finance and Economics/东北财经大学)
10.1016/j.ijhydene.2025.03.178	5/46	---
10.1016/j.jclepro.2023.136847	0	---
10.1016/j.jclepro.2023.137262	0	---
10.1016/j.esr.2025.101851	10/34	Weixin Tang (Fuzhou Institute of Technology/福州理工学院), Minglu Huo (Central China Normal University/华中师范大学), Yanhui Wang (Fuzhou University/福州大学), Nawal Abdalla Adam, Bin Bai (Fuzhou University/福州大学)
10.1016/j.esr.2025.101791	25/38	Shaoming Han (Yantai University/烟台大学), Cheng Qian (Shanghai Lixin University of Accounting and Finance/上海立信会计金融学院), Nawal Abdalla Adam, Norboy Karimov, Wang Zhang (Yanshan University/燕山大学)

During a recent investigation, the 5GH Team uncovered 7 articles (highlighted with yellow), which were coauthored by Nawal Abdalla Adam, having high proportion (over 25%) of the references to Muhammad Umair, with Ghazi University, Pakistan.

Additionally, Alexander Magazinov previously posted on PubPeer that 4 articles (highlighted with blue) from NA Adam also served as the citation vehicles to M Umair, resulting in 11 articles with abnormal reference patterns.

Most of these 11 articles also have abnormal authorship patterns: (1) the first authors of them are usually affiliated to Chinese universities, (2) the authors of each articles are usually from multiple nations, including but not limited to China, Saudi Arabia, and Pakistan, (3) there is no overlap of any Chinese author among different articles, suggesting the cooperation was likely faked.

We also noted that M Umair was listed as coauthors on 2 of these 11 article [1-2], it remains unknown if there is a paper mill network between M Umair and NA Adam.

[1] 10.1016/j.ijhydene.2025.03.090

[2] 10.1002/mde.4509

---

This article is licensed to the 5GH Foundation under a CC BY-NC-ND 4.0 International License.